

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO

In re: *
* PROMESA Title III
THE FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT AND *
MANAGEMENT BOARD FOR PUERTO RICO, * Case No. 17-BK-03283-LTS
* (Jointly Administered)
as representative of *
* RE: ECF No. 15356, 15363,
THE COMMONWEALTH OF PUERTO RICO, * 15486, 15511, 15572,
et al. * 15782, 15855
*
Debtors. *

----- *
* PROMESA Title III
FREDERIC CHARDON DUBOS, *
*
Movant, *
*
v. *
*
THE FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT AND *
MANAGEMENT BOARD FOR PUERTO RICO, *
*
as representative of *
*
THE COMMONWEALTH OF PUERTO RICO, *
*
Respondent. *

REPLY TO OBJECTION ECF NO. 15782
OF THE FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT AND MANAGEMENT BOARD FOR PUERTO RICO
TO MOTION REQUESTING TURNOVER OF MOTOR VEHICLE ECF NO. 15356
TO THE HONORABLE COURT:

NOW COMES movant the undersigned attorney on his own behalf
and respectfully states as follows:

I. FACTS

1. Movant is the registrar owner in Puerto Rico of a 2000 Oldsmobile Intrigue GX Oro ("Motor Vehicle"), VIN: 1G3WH52H0YF122319, Registry: 5682868, License Plate: DRA535, Title: 2738039 and Price: \$26501.94. Attached is the Vehicle Information from the Puerto Rico Department of Transportation.

2. The Motor Vehicle was a gift to Movant's son who was in possession of the same.

3. Sometime in 2014-2015, prior to the filing of the above captioned case, the Police Department of Debtor seized the Motor Vehicle from Movant's son.

4. Movant located and last saw the Motor Vehicle in the Police Station car lot at Iturregui Street in Country Club as shown in the picture below but was not given any information about its fate.



5. Upon information and belief the Motor Vehicle was never

1 used as evidence in any criminal trial nor was a confiscation
2 complaint ever filed against Movant pursuant to the Puerto Rico
3 Confiscation Act, 34 L.P.R.A. §1724, et. seq.

4
5 6. Upon movant's visit to that Police Station's car lot he
6 was informed many cars had been removed from the lot.

7
8 7. Movant contacted on February 18, 2021 the Puerto Rico
9 Confiscation Board and was informed the motor vehicle never made
10 to their facilities and that is why no confiscation proceedings
11 were ever started.

12
13 8. The motor vehicle is still in the possession and custody
14 of the Puerto Rico Police Department its location unknown.

15 Sworn to and subscribed under penalty of perjury on this
16 19th day of February, 2021.

17 s/Frederic Chardon Dubos
18 Frederic Chardon Dubos
19 Movant/Attorney

20 **II. THE STIPULATION COUNTER OFFER**

21 9. Following is a verbatim copy of the counter-offer made by
22 movant in a January 7, 2021 email and restated un subsequent
23 communications:

24
25 There should be no dispute the motor vehicle in dispute
26 belongs to the undersigned, see today's attached Vehicle
27 Information in the Spanish language. The automatic stay
28 11 USC Section 362 applies to property of the state.
Therefore no stay needs to be lifted and is
inappropriate. For that reason I cannot agree and

1 stipulate that the stay will be lifted.

2 As to the undersigned having to file a claim pursuant to
3 Section 19 of the Uniform Forfeiture Act of 2011, 34
4 L.P.R.A. § 1724 et seq. (the "UFA"), before the Puerto
5 Rico Court of First Instance, plain reading of the
6 statute does not allow me to do that. The reason is that
7 section 1724j and 1724l provide that prior to doing that
8 Debtor has to send notice of the confiscation to the
9 registry owner. That was never done and it's a
jurisdictional issue and all jurisdictional terms for the
debtor have elapsed. So the debtor will not be able to
confiscate the motor vehicle.

10 For these reasons I would be willing to stipulate that
11 this issue is a strict bankruptcy issue which the
12 bankruptcy judge can resolve without the need to lift the
13 stay. Alternatively, the debtor will first send notice
of the confiscation and I will contest it pursuant to UFA
in state court.

14 10. Movant would still be willing to stipulate the above.

15 11. Additionally, debtor's proposed stipulation does not
16 address issues such as the raising by debtor of a sovereign
17 immunity or time barred defense which it's submitted would be
18 moot if the debtor starts a UFA case against movant.
19

20 **III. LEGAL ISSUES**

21 **A. THE BANKRUPTCY RULES**

22 12. The motor vehicle in question belongs to movant and is
23 not part of the debtor's bankruptcy estate. Generally see, In Re
24 ICL Holding Co., Inc., 802 F.3d 547 (3CA 2015).
25

26 13. It's submitted to this Honorable Court that a plain
27 reading of Bankruptcy Rules 7001.(1) and (9) and 7003 make their
28

1 reliance by debtor misplaced and inapplicable to the above
2 referenced case and matter.

3 14. They along with 11 USC §554(b) and §725 refer to the
4 recovery of money or property belonging to the estate which
5 clearly is not the case here.
6

7 15. The motor vehicle does not belong to the debtor's
8 bankruptcy estate but belongs to movant who can legally do
9 whatever he wishes with it.
10

11 **B. WAS THE SEIZURE IMPROPER?**

12 16. That is precisely what will be litigated under Puerto
13 Rico state/territory law pursuant UFA.
14

15 17. This Honorable Court in it's discretion has many options
16 here, but movant is willing to stipulate that the Puerto Rico
17 Government be ordered to commence a UFA case against movant which
18 would be a more efficient use of both this court's judicial
19 resources as those of the Puerto Rico judiciary.
20

21 18. Debtor's Objection states attempts have been made to
22 locate the motor vehicle without success which worries movant
23 since records are supposed to be kept by the Puerto Rico Police
24 Department.
25

26 19. The Puerto Rico Police Department should start an
27 administrative investigation immediately.
28

C. RETURN OF MOTOR VEHICLE OR CASH EQUIVALENT

20. Those are remedies provided by UFA.

21. If under UFA the return is ordered that would be an In rem action.

22. Pursuant to UFA the value of the motor vehicle would be determined at the time of the seizure in lieu of the return.

23. No Puerto Rico Court judgment existed at the time of filing debtor's bankruptcy ordering the payment of money to movant, the only expectation at the time was the return of the motor vehicle.

D. CONCLUSION

24. For all of the above stated reasons upon the filing of the above captioned case the Motor Vehicle was not part of property of the estate and nothing has been done since filing by Debtor pursuant to 11 U.S.C. §541(a)(5) to make it part of the estate.

WHEREFORE, movant the undersigned attorney on his own behalf respectfully requests that for the above stated reasons this Honorable Court conclude that as a matter of law:

a. The Motor Vehicle is not part of Debtor's estate and belongs to movant;

b. Deny debtor's Objection ECF No. 15782; and

Page 7 of 7

1 c. Order the Puerto Rico Government to start a UFA case
2 against movant.

3 Respectfully submitted, in Carolina, Puerto Rico this 19th
4 day of February, 2021.

6 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE, LOCAL RULE 5005-4(h)(1), P.R. LBR**

7 Movant hereby certifies that on this day, Movant
8 electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court
9 uploading the same using the CM/ECF System which will send
10 notification of such filing to the all CM/ECF participants.
11

12 **Frederic Chardon Dubs Law Office**

13 s/Frederic Chardon Dubos

14 **Frederic Chardon Dubos**

15 USDC-PR 201601

16 P.O. Box 1797

17 Carolina, Puerto Rico, 00984-1797

18 Tel. (787) 908-2476

19 email fcdlaw2020@gmail.com
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28